



Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
Chief Minister

16th July 2018

Dear Chief Minister,

Policy Development Boards

As you will be aware, I first wrote to you relaying the Chairmen's Committee's emerging concerns about Policy Development Boards (PDB's) on 2nd July. While I await a response to that letter, the Committee has considered in detail the overarching terms of reference that you have compiled for PDB's, and the specific terms of reference for the Hospital PDB.

In relation to the Hospital PDB the Committee has identified a number of significant issues, including:

- The Committee's agreement that both Deputy Huelin (PAC) and Deputy Pointon (Health and Social Security Panel) are conflicted according to your overarching term of reference 4, compromising their Scrutiny roles and the work of their Panel/Committee
- The potential 'drain' this Board has on Scrutiny Member resources
- The resemblance of the Hospital PDB and its proposed work and processes to a Scrutiny Panel/PAC, and the confusion this introduces into the machinery of government
- The undermining of the work of the formally mandated Future Hospital Review Panel

On behalf of the Committee, I would ask you to re-consider the formation of the Hospital PDB. We believe the nature of the work it proposes to undertake is more appropriately a matter for Scrutiny, in this case the well-established Future Hospital Review Panel. The Review Panel would be willing to incorporate the proposed work of the PDB within its imminent phase of work, and would invite Deputies Huelin and Pointon to join its membership. It is also the case that as a properly constituted Scrutiny Panel it has funded officer support, whilst the resourcing of the PDB's is not entirely clear. Indeed we would welcome more information from you on the resourcing/funding of PDB's.

In the wider context, the example of the Hospital PDB has raised serious concerns amongst the Chairmen's Committee as to the appropriateness of PDB's as you envisage them, as have the overarching terms of reference. We foresee potentially serious consequences emerging for the Scrutiny function. As an additional point of principle, the blurring of lines between Executive and Scrutiny responsibilities in the Ministerial system of government, in doing so effectively compromising the Troy rule, cannot be supported.

There are a number of matters to discuss with you about PDB's and I would ask that a meeting is arranged at the earliest opportunity to enable us to do so. I understand that the Head of Scrutiny has, on my behalf, requested a first meeting between us but in nearly two weeks has yet to receive a response. I would be grateful if this could be addressed as soon as possible.

In the meantime, given the strength of our concerns the Committee requests that you suspend the establishment of any more PDB's until those matters are discussed.

To be transparent, please be advised that Senator Ferguson has dissented from this letter.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Kristina Moore".

Senator Kristina Moore
President, Chairmen's Committee